Work-Related Stress & Well Being in Critical Care Nurses:
Findings of an Integrative Review

Louise McCallum - PhD Student   @loumccallum
Supervisors - Prof. Martyn Jones & Dr Janice Rattray
Is Work-Related Stress a Problem for Nurses?

Work Stress, Anxiety & Depression between 2014/15

Prevalence Rate per 100,000

Housing & Welfare
Nursing
Teaching
Managers & Directors
Science, Engineering & Technology

(Health & Safety Executive 2015)
Is Work-Related Stress A Problem for CCNs?

**The Psychological Stresses of Intensive Care Unit Nursing**

Donald Hay, MD and Donald Oken, MD

Work in the ICU provides formidable stresses for nursing personnel. A major problem is the repetitive exposure to death and dying, posing threats of object loss and personal failure. Defensive distancing techniques support continuing function but raise secondary adaptive problems. The impossible work overload and lack of gratification from obtunded patients add to the problems of maintaining self-esteem. The special nature of the work promotes communication breakdowns with physicians, relatives and nursing and hospital administration, leading to lack of support from these crucial groups—indeed added stress. The necessity for intimate cooperation leads to intragroup tensions. These and similar factors are examined in terms of their psychological and interpersonal demands and the adaptive maneuvers to which they give rise. From an analysis of these, measures are suggested for the structural, procedural and administrative improvement of the ICU; the role of a liaison psychiatrist is discussed.

**STRESSES ON THE NURSE IN AN INTENSIVE-CARE UNIT**

Ruth Vreeland, R.N. and Geraldine L. Ellis, R.N.

Stresses identified in this communication are those observed in nurses assigned to a four-bed unit in the Clinical Center, National Institute of Health, Bethesda, Md. This intensive-care unit (ICU) is designed to facilitate the recovery of individual patients after general and radical surgical procedures, but not open-heart or neurological operation. Most of the surgery has been done because of cancer often following prior extension but unsuccessful attempts at curative radiation. Radical procedures for cancer included head and neck dissection, pelvic exenteration, hemipelvectomy, and thoracic surgery. The length of patient stay in the unit varied from a few hours to as long as five weeks.

Stresses experienced by nurses in this setting have been, with minor variations, comparable to those found in most intensive care units.
Integrative Literature Review Questions - 1

1. For CCNs, how is work-related stress conceptualised and defined?

2. With reference to CCNs, what factors are associated with perceptions of work-related stress for CCNs? Including:
   (a) Individual/personal characteristics;
   (b) The work environment; and
   (c) Job characteristics

3. With reference to CCNs, what are the consequences of work-related stress for the:
   (a) Individual?
   (b) Team?
   (c) Organisation?
   (d) Patients?
Integrative Literature Review Questions - 2

4. What are the factors which moderate and/or mediate the effects of work-related stressors on:
   (a) Individual nurse well-being?
   (b) Performance?
   (c) Patient safety?
   (d) Team functioning?
   (e) Organisational outcomes?

5. Is there a relationship between patient safety and CCN work-related stress and well-being?
Integrative Literature Review Framework

Problem Identification

Literature Search

Data Evaluation

Data Analysis

Presentation of Findings

(Whittmore & Knafl 2005)
Integrative Literature Search - Method

• Search Strategy
  - June 2014 to Sept 2014

  - Electronic Databases included: EBSCO Collections (CINAHL Plus, MEDLINE, PsycINFO, Psychology & Behavioural Sciences Collections, Health Business Elite, Info Science & Technology Abstracts, eBook Collection); EBSCO HOST; Web of Science.

  - PICO acronym used.

• Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria Set
  - Adult CCNs only
**PRISMA 2009 Flow Diagram**

1. **Titles selected from Initial Search using Search String:**
   - EBSCO (n = 883)
   - Scopus (n = 63)
   - WoS (n = 1512)
   - OVID (n = 1442)
   - Google Scholar (n = 129)
   - JBI (n = 15)
   - Pub Med (n = 67)

2. **Total Records Once Titles Identified through Database Searches (n = 3311)**

3. **Total Records Once Titles Identified & Duplicates Removed (n = 2887)**

4. **Total Records after Abstracts Screened by 2 Reviewers (n = 311)**

5. **Records Removed Once Date Limits (2004-14) Applied (n = 104)**

6. **Full Text Articles Screened (n = 206), Papers from 2004-14**

7. **Papers Excluded with Reasons for (n = 157):**
   - i) Mixed Sample Unable to Separate Results (n = 78)
   - ii) Pilot Study (n = 5)
   - iii) Sample Size (n = 23)
   - iv) Stress Not Measured (n = 38)
   - v) Not Empirical Research (n = 9)
   - vi) Not English Language (n = 1)
   - vii) Duplicate Study Content Included Elsewhere (n = 3)

8. **Full-text articles Assessed for Eligibility & Quality (n = 49)**

9. **Included:**
   - Qualitative Studies (n = 12)
   - Mixed Methods Studies (n = 1)
   - Quantitative Studies (n = 36)
Results - Descriptive Data

- **Papers of Limited Quality:**
  
  QATSDSDD Scores: Mean = 64%; Range =36%-92%

- **From 20 Different Countries, including:**
  
  Pan European (n=2);
  USA (n=22);
  South Africa (n=3);
  Netherlands (n=4).
  No Scottish Studies.

- **Studies Predominantly Descriptive, Observational Design (n=39)**
1. How is Work-Related Stress Conceptualised in CCN Studies?
2. What Factors are Associated with Work-Related Stress in CCNs?

- Limited consensus between studies.

- **Individual/Personal Characteristics**
  - CCN age, years of experience & resilience

- **Work Environment**
  - Macro/Meso/Micro Level

- **Job Characteristics**
  - Lack of Decision Authority, Autonomy & Lack of Structural Empowerment & Shift Work

  (van Dam et al 2013; Mrayyan 2009; Tummers et al 2006; Tigert & Laschinger 2004)
3. What are the Consequences of Work-Related Stress in CCNs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Individual Consequences</th>
<th>Team Consequences</th>
<th>Organisation Consequences</th>
<th>Patients Consequences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Psychological</strong></td>
<td>Burnout Contagion</td>
<td>Mortality Rate</td>
<td>Patient Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Affect/Mood</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Length of Patient Stay</td>
<td>Quality of Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cognitive</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Intention to Leave/Quit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Physical</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Musculoskeletal</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symptoms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Behaviour</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Turnover, Absenteeism</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What are Third Variables?

- Cause (independent variable)
- Effect/outcome (dependent variable)
- Other factor (confounding variable)
4. What Factors Moderate &/or Mediate the Effects of Work-Related Stressors?

Moderating effect of ‘supervisory support’ on the relationship between CCNs perceptions of ‘threat’ and ‘psychological distress’ among CCNs (P=0.023)

(Verhaeghe et al 2008)
5. Is there a Relationship Between Patient Safety & CCN Work-Related Stress & Well-being?

• Cannot be answered conclusively.

• Only 3 studies measured the relationship between CCN work-related stress & patient safety.

• Patient safety operationalised from perception of CCNs & includes:
  - Medication Errors
  - Patient Handling Behaviour
  - Adverse Events & Quality of Care

(Lee et al 2011; Maiden et al 2011; Mallidou et al 2011)
Conclusion

- Antecedent factors.
- Prevalence of work-related stress in CCNs in UK is unclear.
- Motivation & Work Engagement not captured.
- Literature is ‘Atheoretical’.
- Methodological limitations
- Findings are heterogenic.
- Few intervention studies.
Developing & Evaluating Complex Interventions (MRC 2008)

(Source: Craig et al 2013)
Theoretical Underpinning of Proposed Study

(Based on Bakker & Demerouti 2014)


