Factors influencing nurses' intentions to leave adult critical care areas-A mixed method study

Nadeem Khan, part time PhD student & Professional Development Nurse (Adult Critical Care, Oxford University Hospitals NHSFT) and Oxford Brookes University

Supervisory team
Dr Helen Walthall (DOS)
Dr Louise Stayt
Prof Debra Jackson
Background

High turnover and the shortages of specialist nurses has been an ongoing issue

Local, national and international issue

Financial implications

Impacts on staff morale, productivity, patient safety and quality patient outcomes

Gap in current/previous research

Literature review

Sequential Mixed Method Study

Phase 1
• Surveys

Phase 2
• In depth telephone interviews
Intentions to leave

- **Strongly Agree/somewhat agree**
  - ITL current job in the next 12 months: 29.30%
  - ITL current job in the next 3-5 years: 28.60%
  - ITL the profession in the next 1-5 years: 59.40%
Demographics and ITL

Age-ITL nursing profession in 1-5 years strongly agree/somewhat agree

- 18-25: 63.20%
- 26-40: 32.50%
- 41-50: 16.70%
- 51-65+: 22.10%
Demographics and ITL

CC exp-ITL prof in 1-5 years-SA/SA

- 37.30%
- 22.70%
- 15.80%
- 21.90%

Legend:
- 0-2
- 2 upto 5
- 5 upto 10
- 10+
Demographics and ITL

Band-ITL nursing prof in 1-5 years-SA/SA

- 44.40% for band 5
- 34.50% for band 6
- 31.50% for band 7
- 20.60% for band 8 and above
Demographics and ITL

Chi Square test-p values

Age and ITL nursing prof in 1-5 years- <0.001

CC Exp and ITL nursing prof in 1-5 years -0.009

Band & ITL nursing prof in 1-5 years 0.012
Factor analysis

Four sub scales

Autonomy

Working environment

Relationships

Professional development
All 4 sub scale were found to be highly significantly associated with ITL in the three categories:

- ITL current job in 12 months
- ITL current job in 3-5 years
- ITL nursing profession in 1-5 years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITL current job in 12 months</th>
<th>Autonomy</th>
<th>&lt;0.001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working environment</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional development</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITL current job in 3-5 years</th>
<th>Autonomy</th>
<th>&lt;0.001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working environment</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional development</td>
<td>&lt;0.016</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ITL nursing prof in 1-5 years</th>
<th>Autonomy</th>
<th>&lt;0.001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working environment</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional development</td>
<td>&lt;0.002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Logistic Regression analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PV</th>
<th>OR</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Lower</th>
<th>Upper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ITL current job-12 M</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working environment</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.353</td>
<td>0.193</td>
<td>0.646</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships</td>
<td>0.049</td>
<td>0.484</td>
<td>0.235</td>
<td>0.996</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>&lt; 0.001</td>
<td>57.611</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITL current job-3-5 Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.361</td>
<td>0.216</td>
<td>0.604</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age(1)</td>
<td>0.978</td>
<td>1.017</td>
<td>0.299</td>
<td>3.459</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age(2)</td>
<td>0.082</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.249</td>
<td>1.086</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age(3)</td>
<td>0.003</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.137</td>
<td>0.655</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITL N Prof-1-5 Y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.151</td>
<td>0.482</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age(1)</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age(2)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.135</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.286</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age(3)</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.148</td>
<td>0.065</td>
<td>0.334</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>71.14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Content analysis

- 1 Poor working conditions: 27.50%
- 2 Off duty issues and lack of work life balance: 18.84%
- 3 Lack of recognition and appreciation: 15.45%
- 4 Poor pay: 14.49%
- 5 Lack of prof dev and career progression opportunities: 12.07%
- 6 Early retirement due to working conditions: 8.69%
- 7 Promotion and change of career: 2.96%
- 8 Others: 1.48%
Qualitative interviews-Recommendations

Providing support to enhance wellbeing

Supporting on-going education and development

Recognising and appreciating specialist knowledge and skills

Enabling multiple pathways into nursing

Increasing autonomy and shared decision making

Revolutionising model of care delivery
Quotes from the interviews

Part 6: I think there should be better pay for critical care nurses. We are more like mini doctors and I know there is lots of research been done on that over the years, maxi nurse versus mini doctor but that is definitely – we do a lot of the extended roles as a nurse and you make a lot of really important decisions, and you're very active in decision making for patients, yes, so I do think that but I don't think the government would ever get behind it. I hope I’m wrong. I think after 12 months or 2 years in ITU you should become a Band 6 automatically.

Part 1: Am… it was initially when I started, it was some of the staff were very kind of, some of the senior staff were very knowledgeable but bully, and oh there was one very bad bully. It was awful, you know the unit didn't have a good reputation around, because of, you know a few people that worked here. Am… I did learn a lot from them but they were just not nice people to work for!!!
Part 2: Well, if I was the government, getting rid of the pay cut, and a nice pay rise, that would be number one, and I think what the staff wants more than anything is training, and access to training and access to development. So I think if the ward were allocated CPD funding like the Doctors get, when you look at the study leave allocation for the medical profession compare to the nursing profession. It is far it is, its huge and I think that is one of the biggest thing and when you speak to staff apart from having a good work life balance with your roster, they want to be developed, they want to learn, they want to be taught, they want access to training.

Part 10: I think mainly, it’s all about support, especially if someone’s new, it’s a very stressful and draining time. So as much support as we can give them, sort of from the nurse in charge, from, you know, other colleagues and things like that. And then passed that supernumerary period as well, keep continuing with the support and try and make sort of the, you know, the education, to build up their knowledge and their training so they feel more confident and that sort of thing.
Part 15: I just want to mention the sickness, that is what's down to my heart as well, is the sickness policies and how upsetting I find it. I mean, as I mentioned earlier, I’m hardly off sick, I was last year, I wasn’t sick once. And however, when I ever had to ring in sick, and that was, I had to ring in sick at the beginning of this year because I had some severe back problems. And when I spoke to our matron on the phone, because they want you to call in, and I don’t know if the same applies to every other hospital, but here we have to call in every day until, you know, you get, basically, certified from your GP. So I called in and I felt that I’m not believed that I’m actually sick. And that was, it was so upsetting, you know. She didn’t ask once how I am, you know, she didn’t ask once how it happened, you know, or how, you know, there was no acknowledgement. I felt like, I rang in and I’m making it all up, you know, and because of it, she’s going to find me another job to do, I can do with this back pain, you know. And I got so upset about it that I confronted her then on my next telephone call. And she said to me, I said, I did not appreciate how you actually were talking to me because I felt like I’m making it all up, you know, you made me feel like I’m making it all up. And she said, it’s not what I think, that’s what she said, it’s not down to what I think, it’s how it works here. And I said, oh alright, you know. And I find that, you know, and it’s not, sadly enough, it’s not the only one I experienced like that, it’s a lot of my colleagues experience the same way.
Part 1: More and more people need to shine a light onto our little critical acre area, because I think a bit of a forgotten area you know, we talk about the pressures on A+E and A+E and A+E, you know, You know, but am… a critical care never get to mention, you know….

Part 2: The other big factor is critical care staff being moved to the ward, It’s a huge problem, they will leave critical care quite happily and the promise is, I think every time we have sent a nurse, we will, you know, is so they are happy and we left short, can we have the nurse, I don’t think we ever get the nurse back from where they went to work, we have lost staff, we have staff leave because they get moved regularly and they said on their exit interview that that’s the fundamental reason, we had our health care assistant leave and we had our staff leave.

Part 3: They don't know where everything is, they don't know where everything is kept and that in itself could be stressful when you not sure who to ask about it or what’s going on and that type of patient so it’s difficult so we were trying to get a system in place before they go so they know what’s their boundaries are so they feel comfortable in going.
Part 8: Until they address those outside issues- GPs working seven days, I don't think that's going to help at all. I think you need more community nurses; you need to keep the older folk that are well enough to be at home, at home. I think they come into hospital and then they go quicker. Hospital is not a good place to be if you're elderly. That's my bugbear that they need to start looking. I don't know how you do that. You should always have a solution if you're going to whinge about something. I would say throw more money into public health, not necessarily throw because that's bit tough but they need to start putting in perhaps more support workers. Mental health, that needs to be addressed. A lot of people end up here that don't need to be here and then I think it makes it ten times worse, especially in A&E, the worst place to put- it's a place of safety, isn't it, for someone with mental health issues but then they need a bed. Year on year they cut mental health service funding. Elderly care is shocking, the funds for elderly care. That would be my- what would I do? I would look outside the building. Yes, redirecting resources appropriately. I'd also get rid of quite a lot of management because I think we spend too much time creating layers of management that we don't need.
Part 8: Sadly, I think certainly in this trust, the attitude to critical care nurses is, "You don't really do a lot, do you? You only have one patient. You sit on your bums all day. It's not hard." I think that's quite demoralising for a team. I think when nurses do come and work with us, they're like, "Oh my gosh. I had no idea." I think our stress levels are increasing, our burnout, our sickness rates certainly because we're picking up extra shifts. The kind of patient has changed. I mean stress levels on things like discharge. We are sending patients home from the critical care ward. You just don't do that. They go to a ward.

Part 8: My bugbear is again people's unrealistic attitudes to what can and can't be done and things like that but again, that's TV, social media and all that sort of thing, isn't it? I just think times have changed. I'm showing my age now. What would I do? I don't know. I fly the flag for nursing wherever I go. I'm quite passionate about it. I must be because I've taken a pay cut. I was earning about £10,000 more seven or eight years ago. I don't know, just promote nursing I think. It's difficult at the moment because we've had no pay rise and hours are long and horrible. I don't know how you'd get people on board really.
Part 15: I mean, of course, you know, if they don’t have the money, they can’t pay for it. But everything, you know, like the car parking, it gets privatised, you know, and then, of course, these private companies want to make money out of it, but it is just, it’s just wrong, you know. I mean we are serving the community and I think that should be taken into account. And that also should be taken into account from the public but all they’re saying, oh you have good pensions and this, that and the other. Well, you know, our pensions have got really, really scrapped and thinned down. And, at the end of the day, I’m looking after you when you’re ill and I’m looking after your father and your mother and your sister, you know, is that not, is that not, should be appreciated a bit more.

I mean also, you know, the pay with, to get your, hold your pin number, every year is a hundred and twenty pound, I think it is. I think that is absolutely ridiculous, you know, for what? What are they doing actually, for my hundred and twenty pound? In ……… it was free. I never ever had to pay for keeping my registration.
Part 15: So other things, which I think is also traumatic, you know, also what’s very much in the news, you know, withdrawing of patient care and the issue with relatives if they want to carry on. And that is really, really hard going. We had a patient probably six/seven months ago, with…… and she progressed really, really quickly, but the family didn’t, want to carry on and were insisting, he did not want it being withdrawn. And he was at the end of his life and the lawyers got involved and all sorts. It was, for all of us, it was so, so hard, and especially then to get the staff to look after this particular patient, it was, yes, it was hard going, yes.

I mean occasionally we have debriefs, especially with this gentleman, with the disease, because there were lots of people affected. And I think maybe we had the debrief actually, because the management were so involved in it. But in general, generally, there’s no structure and support or, you know, psychological input.

Part 1: I think more people, just have more wellbeing, I just you know, and a bit more focus on wellbeing, you know more mandatory, like I said when my boss brought the psychologist, if there had been a session where we all went to, we were all kind of, this is an hour blocked out to go to, something like that, may be onto a study day whatever, making wellbeing more of a mandatory thing.
Part 2: I think they have to be involved, and I think that’s the key, you have to involve nurses, nurses understand it on the clinical floor better than anybody, but they are often not involved, not to a higher level, up to a point, at that level, you have people who probably never been in clinical environment, certainly not any kind that would make it feel for it, making decisions about us, so it is an unrealistic picture, you have to involve nurses, you have to involve genuine nurses, not nurses who have made their way up to the you know, to the senior nurse in the trust position, you have involve the nurses who are on the shop floor, the nurses who been doing it for a year or two years, they have got fresh eyes, to see the problem.

Part 10: I feel, for myself, I’d love to do the ITU course but there isn’t the option down here, which that’s one of the things, which I, you know, I would love to do, but I haven’t got the option of doing that.

Part 7: First of all, we have got to make sure that we educate our 22-year olds. The other thing is, can we do anything that will retain our 55-year olds?
Part 15: I think the training has to be better, not as, I think nurses, we should be trained in an academic way, but it’s getting too much to the academic side of it. And there’s the loss of basic nursing care, it gets totally lost in that. And I think everybody should go back to basics and yes, of course, they should do some research, you know, in that year, two or three or whatever they do, but is that what you need to do when you come out of University? It is how to identify, you know, symptoms and identify basic patient’s needs, and how to wash a patient, how to talk to a patient, you know. Also, what I don’t find right, that the nurses have to pay to be trained.
I’ve done a training course in management and one, how do you say that, well they said, in one of the sessions, they said, eighty percent of staff are leaving because of the management. And I have to agree, I have to agree with this, loads of my colleagues in the last five years, very experienced, very good intensive care nurses, left because of this.

Yes, and that is, I think, that is the crucial point, that staffs don’t feel appreciated. I worked part time for quite a long time, two days a week, and then it took me two years to increase my hours, two years I had to ask for my regular hours. And on one occasion I had a meeting with my manager and she said to me, and bearing in mind, you know, how experienced I am, and I don’t want to do anything else actually to work on intensive care, you know, because I like it. And she seriously said to me, have you thought of changing career and go somewhere else? Yes. That’s what she said to me, only because I asked for more hours. Yes, and I was so gobsmacked, you know. And then I thought does she actually not want to keep me, does she want to get rid of me? And that is one of the, yes, when lots of people also left and yes, I was, yes, it was quite upsetting actually.
What’s next?
Acknowledgement

Thank you to:

• Supervisory team and OBU
• Oxford University Hospitals
• The Critical Care Network UK
Thank you